**Cargo Planning Heuristic Analysis**

Artificial Intelligence Nanodegree

Written by: Will Trott

1. **Non-heuristic search results**

***Breadth\_first\_search***

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Air Cargo P1 | Air Cargo P2 | Air Cargo P3 |
| Node Expansions Required | 43 | 3343 | 14663 |
| Number of Goal Tests | 56 | 4609 | 18098 |
| Time Elapsed | .024 sec | 10.130 sec | 79.155 sec |
| Plan Length | 6 | 9 | 12 |

***Depth\_first\_graph\_search***

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Air Cargo P1 | Air Cargo P2 | Air Cargo P3 |
| Node Expansions Required | 12 | 582 | 627 |
| Number of Goal Tests | 13 | 583 | 628 |
| Time Elapsed | .006 sec | 2.276 sec | 2.453 sec |
| Plan Length | 12 | 575 | 596 |

***Uniform Cost Search***

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Air Cargo P1 | Air Cargo P2 | Air Cargo P3 |
| Node Expansions Required | 55 | 4835 | 18235 |
| Number of Goal Tests | 57 | 4837 | 18237 |
| Time Elapsed | .027 sec | 8.516 sec | 38.088 sec |
| Plan Length | 6 | 9 | 12 |

The tables above show the results for each of the three non-heuristic searches that I performed. Of the three, breadth first search and uniform cost search both output plans of the same length, and had a very similar number of goal tests as well. Their first major difference is in the number of node expansions required, since breadth first search terminates node expansion as soon as a goal is found while uniform cost expands all nodes at the same depth as the goal node.[[1]](#footnote-1) The other difference was in run-time where uniform cost search was about twice as fast as breadth first search.

Depth first graph search was the overall fastest of the three searches as well as being the search that performed the best when it came to number of goal tests and node expansions. However, the major drawback of this search type was that the plans that it returned were all too long to be realistic. This is caused by depth first search expanding along the deepest node until it reaches a goal state. For this reason, I think that it was the worst of the three metrics when it came to this problem.

1. **Heuristic Search Results**

***A\* Ignore Preconditions***

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Air Cargo P1 | Air Cargo P2 | Air Cargo P3 |
| Node Expansions Required | 41 | 1450 | 5040 |
| Number of Goal Tests | 43 | 1452 | 5042 |
| Time Elapsed | .027 sec | 3.143 sec | 12.540 sec |
| Plan Length | 6 | 9 | 12 |

***A\* Level-Sum***

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Air Cargo P1 | Air Cargo P2 | Air Cargo P3 |
| Node Expansions Required | 11 | 86 | 316 |
| Number of Goal Tests | 13 | 88 | 318 |
| Time Elapsed | 0.684 sec | 63.593 sec | 361.318 sec |
| Plan Length | 6 | 9 | 12 |

For both A\* searches, the resulting plan lengths were the same. However, this is about the only similarity the two shared as far as the evaluated metrics go. The level sum search requires far fewer node expansions and goal tests, but is incredibly slow in comparison to the ignore preconditions search. This leads me to believe that level-sum is the inferior method between the two heuristic searches, although I’m sure that ignore preconditions has some weaknesses that are just not being exposed by this project.

1. **Conclusions**

Based on the metrics provided, the best search method is A\* Ignore Preconditions. As mentioned in the heuristic search results section, while the resulting plan for both A\* methods is the same, the run time of the level-sum method makes it appear infeasible for anything but easy problems. Then all that is left is to compare it to the non-heuristic methods mentioned previously. Of these three, the one that I felt was most optimal was the uniform cost search since it performed similarly to breadth first search in all aspects but run time, where it was a much better solution. However, comparing A\* ignore preconditions to uniform cost search shows how much of a difference there is in the two algorithms. In all metrics but plan length, where the two tied, the A\* method performed much better.

1. **Optimal Plans(A\* ignore preconditions)**

**Problem 1**

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, SFO)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

**Problem 2**

Load(C3, P3, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P3, SFO)

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, SFO)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

**Problem 3**

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Load(C4, P2, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Unload(C4, P2, SFO)

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Load(C3, P1, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Unload(C3, P1, JFK)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

**Appendix**

**Problem 1**

Solving Air Cargo Problem 1 using breadth\_first\_search...

Expansions Goal Tests New Nodes

43 56 180

Plan length: 6 Time elapsed in seconds: 0.023502856030687205

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P2, JFK, SFO)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

Solving Air Cargo Problem 1 using depth\_first\_graph\_search...

Expansions Goal Tests New Nodes

12 13 48

Plan length: 12 Time elapsed in seconds: 0.005857303086430218

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, SFO)

Load(C1, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, JFK, SFO)

Unload(C1, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Load(C2, P1, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, JFK, SFO)

Unload(C2, P1, SFO)

Solving Air Cargo Problem 1 using uniform\_cost\_search...

Expansions Goal Tests New Nodes

55 57 224

Plan length: 6 Time elapsed in seconds: 0.027310409885554207

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, SFO)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Solving Air Cargo Problem 1 using astar\_search with h\_ignore\_preconditions...

Expansions Goal Tests New Nodes

41 43 170

Plan length: 6 Time elapsed in seconds: 0.027484875282081614

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, SFO)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Solving Air Cargo Problem 1 using astar\_search with h\_pg\_levelsum...

Expansions Goal Tests New Nodes

11 13 50

Plan length: 6 Time elapsed in seconds: 0.6840241714939324

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, SFO)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

**Problem 2**

Solving Air Cargo Problem 2 using breadth\_first\_search...

Expansions Goal Tests New Nodes

3343 4609 30509

Plan length: 9 Time elapsed in seconds: 10.130207879757396

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Load(C3, P3, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, SFO)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P3, SFO)

Solving Air Cargo Problem 2 using depth\_first\_graph\_search...

Expansions Goal Tests New Nodes

582 583 5211

Plan length: 575 Time elapsed in seconds: 2.2763368228360896

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Load(C1, P3, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C1, P3, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C2, P1, JFK)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Unload(C2, P1, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Load(C2, P3, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C3, P1, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C2, P3, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Unload(C3, P1, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Load(C1, P1, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Load(C3, P2, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Unload(C3, P2, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Load(C3, P3, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Unload(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P3, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Load(C3, P1, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P1, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Load(C3, P2, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Load(C2, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Load(C3, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P1, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Unload(C2, P1, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Load(C3, P3, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P3, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C1, P2, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Load(C2, P3, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C2, P3, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, SFO)

Fly(P1, JFK, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Load(C2, P1, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, JFK, SFO)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Unload(C1, P2, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Unload(C2, P1, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Load(C3, P1, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Unload(C3, P1, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Load(C2, P1, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, SFO)

Load(C1, P1, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Load(C1, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C1, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C2, P1, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Load(C1, P3, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Load(C2, P3, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C1, P3, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Unload(C2, P3, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Unload(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Load(C1, P3, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Unload(C2, P2, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Unload(C1, P3, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Load(C3, P3, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Unload(C3, P3, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Load(C1, P3, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Load(C2, P3, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C2, P3, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Unload(C1, P3, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Load(C1, P1, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Load(C3, P3, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Unload(C3, P3, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Load(C3, P1, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P1, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Load(C2, P1, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Load(C1, P2, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Unload(C1, P2, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C2, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C3, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Unload(C3, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Load(C1, P3, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P3, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Load(C3, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C1, P3, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P3, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P3, SFO, ATL)

Unload(C3, P1, SFO)

Solving Air Cargo Problem 2 using uniform\_cost\_search...

Expansions Goal Tests New Nodes

4835 4837 43877

Plan length: 9 Time elapsed in seconds: 8.515902360163206

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Load(C3, P3, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, SFO)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P3, SFO)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

Solving Air Cargo Problem 2 using astar\_search with h\_ignore\_preconditions...

Expansions Goal Tests New Nodes

1450 1452 13303

Plan length: 9 Time elapsed in seconds: 3.1425274161996235

Load(C3, P3, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P3, SFO)

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, SFO)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

Solving Air Cargo Problem 2 using astar\_search with h\_pg\_levelsum...

Expansions Goal Tests New Nodes

86 88 841

Plan length: 9 Time elapsed in seconds: 63.59331093240503

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, SFO)

Load(C3, P3, ATL)

Fly(P3, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P3, SFO)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

**Problem 3**

Solving Air Cargo Problem 3 using breadth\_first\_search...

Expansions Goal Tests New Nodes

14663 18098 129631

Plan length: 12 Time elapsed in seconds: 79.15549805633275

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Load(C4, P2, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Load(C3, P1, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

Unload(C3, P1, JFK)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Unload(C4, P2, SFO)

Solving Air Cargo Problem 3 using depth\_first\_graph\_search...

Expansions Goal Tests New Nodes

627 628 5176

Plan length: 596 Time elapsed in seconds: 2.452578727144882

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C1, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C1, P2, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C2, P1, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C2, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C2, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Load(C3, P1, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Load(C1, P2, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C1, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C3, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P2, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Load(C2, P2, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Unload(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Load(C1, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Unload(C1, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Load(C4, P1, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Unload(C4, P1, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Load(C3, P1, JFK)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C3, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Load(C4, P2, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C4, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P2, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C4, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Unload(C4, P2, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Load(C3, P2, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Unload(C3, P2, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Load(C1, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C1, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Load(C4, P1, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C4, P1, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Load(C2, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C2, P1, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, JFK)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Load(C4, P2, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, ORD)

Unload(C4, P2, SFO)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ATL)

Load(C2, P1, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C2, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C4, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, SFO)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Load(C3, P2, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Unload(C4, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Load(C4, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Unload(C4, P2, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P1, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Load(C1, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C1, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Load(C4, P1, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C3, P2, SFO)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, ORD, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Unload(C3, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Unload(C4, P1, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Load(C3, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P2, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Load(C4, P2, SFO)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Load(C3, P1, SFO)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Unload(C4, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Load(C2, P2, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Unload(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Load(C1, P2, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Load(C4, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C4, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Unload(C1, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P1, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Load(C1, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C2, P2, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Unload(C2, P2, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C1, P2, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Load(C1, P1, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C4, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C4, P2, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C3, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C3, P2, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C1, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C1, P2, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C4, P1, JFK)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C4, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Load(C4, P2, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Load(C2, P1, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Unload(C4, P2, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Load(C3, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, SFO)

Unload(C2, P1, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P2, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Fly(P1, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P2, ATL, JFK)

Unload(C3, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P1, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, ATL)

Load(C2, P2, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, SFO)

Fly(P2, SFO, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ORD)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P1, ORD, JFK)

Fly(P2, ORD, ATL)

Load(C4, P2, ATL)

Fly(P2, ATL, ORD)

Fly(P1, JFK, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P1, ORD, ATL)

Unload(C4, P2, SFO)

Solving Air Cargo Problem 3 using uniform\_cost\_search...

Expansions Goal Tests New Nodes

18235 18237 159716

Plan length: 12 Time elapsed in seconds: 38.08794458721839

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Load(C3, P1, ATL)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Load(C4, P2, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Unload(C4, P2, SFO)

Unload(C3, P1, JFK)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

Solving Air Cargo Problem 3 using astar\_search with h\_ignore\_preconditions...

Expansions Goal Tests New Nodes

5040 5042 44944

Plan length: 12 Time elapsed in seconds: 12.540093433964117

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Load(C4, P2, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Unload(C4, P2, SFO)

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Load(C3, P1, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Unload(C3, P1, JFK)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

Solving Air Cargo Problem 3 using astar\_search with h\_pg\_levelsum...

Expansions Goal Tests New Nodes

316 318 2912

Plan length: 12 Time elapsed in seconds: 361.31819361392354

Load(C2, P2, JFK)

Fly(P2, JFK, ORD)

Load(C4, P2, ORD)

Fly(P2, ORD, SFO)

Load(C1, P1, SFO)

Fly(P1, SFO, ATL)

Load(C3, P1, ATL)

Fly(P1, ATL, JFK)

Unload(C4, P2, SFO)

Unload(C3, P1, JFK)

Unload(C2, P2, SFO)

Unload(C1, P1, JFK)

1. Russell, Stuart J., and Peter Norvig. “Uniform-cost Search” *Artificial Intelligence: a Modern Approach*, 3rd ed., Pearson, 2016, p. 85. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)